



25/485
January 6, 1995
5 Shevat 5755

Sh'ma

A JOURNAL OF JEWISH RESPONSIBILITY

Celebrating 25 years of diversity and dialogue

In this issue

In this issue and the next, we examine some questions of gender and Judaism: who we are today as Jewish women and Jewish men; what, if any, are the enduring gender distinctions encoded in Judaism? How shall we raise our sons and daughters? We begin with women.

Defining Gender Shira Milgrom

When our youngest child was about two and a half years old, my husband, David, was giving her a bath. Out of the blue, she turned to him and said, "Abba, God likes boys better than girls." David, in one of his more brilliant parenting moments didn't say, "Oh no, honey, that's not true." Instead he asked, "What makes you say that?" To which Liore answered simply and directly, "Well, God has a penis and boys have a penis, so God likes boys better."

Two comments. First, what would have made my daughter think that God has a penis? Trust me, there is no picture of God hanging on the walls of our home--and certainly not one of God with a penis. So why would she think that? Don't underestimate for a moment the power of the pronoun. Liore had always--like you and me--heard God described as *He*, and having two brothers and a father, she knew exactly what a 'he' looked like.

Different Body, Different Worth

The second is the more subtle and therefore the more powerful. Because Liore imagined God as male, she thought of herself as worth less in God's eyes--as ultimately worth less. Yes, the way that our religious system defines us through our being male or female--this is extraordinarily powerful. And this has to do with Reform Jews, too.

Within the traditional halakhic framework, women and slaves are at the same level of obligation, a general principal stated in Hagigah 4a: 'Every precept

which is obligatory on a woman is obligatory on a slave; every precept which is not obligatory on a woman is not obligatory on a slave.' This parallel status is reconfirmed daily within the traditional liturgy in the morning blessings: 'Thank you God for not having made me a non-Jew, for not having made me a slave, for not having made me a woman.'

On Not Being Obligated

This tradition considers that one who isn't obligated to fulfill a commandment may not help someone who *is* obligated to fulfill that commandment. I remember attending a Women's *Tefillah*, a traditional women's prayer group, in Riverdale soon after coming to New York. My pleasure in being able to support other Jewish women in their active engagement with prayer and a life of commandedness, of mitzvah, was mitigated by the realization that the terms upon which they formed a prayer group were that they not constitute a *minyán*.

As each woman was called to the Torah, she needed to silently omit the beginning of the Torah blessing (the *bar-*

Inside...

Adina Lewittes	p. 3
Rivkah Myers Shifren	p. 4
Rebecca Weiner	p. 6
Ta sh'ma	p. 7
But others say about	p. 7
Book reviews	p. 8

chu, for which a *minyan* of men is required) which she had always heard, and then continue aloud with the rest of the blessing. The amputated melody was a vivid reminder of the still-partial status that defined women's participation in traditional liturgical Jewish life.

As liberal Jews, we have rejected the categories of religious privilege and exclusion which determine who is and who isn't commanded. We have written gender inclusive liturgy, calling God neither he nor she--but the Eternal One, the One of Blessing, the Holy. Women are included in a *minyan*. We welcome our daughters into the covenant of Israel--girls as *b'not mitzvah*--and the voice of the woman is heard under the wedding canopy.

But in the liberal Jewish community, this brings us face-to-face with other problems. Yes, we have rejected the categories of religious privilege and obligation. However, the Reform Jewish community has not defined itself as a community of religious obligation, and ironically, having levelled religious obligation in terms of gender, *no one* feels religiously commanded or obligated. The challenge to Reform is to develop Reform Jews and Reform communities that know themselves to be religiously commanded; this is an issue which transcends gender.

Equal Possibilities

Having levelled religious obligations, we must also ask have we levelled gender distinctions? What, if anything, will distinguish men from women and Jewish men from Jewish women? Should anything, Jewishly, distinguish men from women?

"Gender" is the translation of one's sex into socially determined roles. Nothing should be excluded from the social opportunities extended to men and women. This includes all career possibilities, the opportunity to raise and nurture children and full access to all aspects of religious life. This equal access/opportunity is predicated on the assumption that talent, drive, intellectual capacity, the need to realize one's uniqueness and the need to transcend one's aloneness are qualities of the individual human being not dependent upon gender.

If levelling gender distinctions within a Jewish context brings closer the fulfillment of these human potentials, *kama tov*, so much the better. It should not be ethically possible to challenge that which increases the humanity within us on the basis that it compromises gender, anymore than deepening one's Jewishness should compromise one's humanity.

SHIRA MILGROM is Associate Rabbi at The Jewish Community Center of White Plains, a Reform congregation, and teaches for CLAL.

Studies of gender, both in medicine and in the social sciences, have challenged our fundamental view that the world is divided into discrete categories of male and female (a subject of discussion not unknown to the rabbis of the *mishna*), suggesting instead that there is a continuum of sex/sexuality that ranges from male to female, with many variations along the way. Many of us recognize within ourselves a complexity of characteristics spanning the range which society defines as maleness and femaleness. Yes, allowing the recognition and expression of this complexity does challenge some of our fundamental conceptions of gender.

The Mystery Will Not Be Silent

However, there is theory and there is the mystery which is the reality of our lives. As complicated as our understanding of our "selves" may be, it is still through the "self" that we experience the world--we live an embodied experience. Gender should never serve as a means to limit access or opportunity; nonetheless, it still functions to organize experience. I just returned from a Jewish

Sh'ma

A JOURNAL OF JEWISH RESPONSIBILITY

Senior Editors Eugene B. Borowitz, Irving Greenberg, Harold M. Schulweis

Editor Nina Beth Cardin

Administrator/Production Bambi Marcus

Contributing Editors Michael Berenbaum, David Bjale, Elliot N. Dorff, Arnold Eisen, David Ellenson, Leonard Fein, Barry Freundel, Reia M. Geffen, Neil Gillman, Joanne Greenberg, Lawrence Hoffman, Paula Hyman, Deborah Dash Moore, David Novak, Riv-Ellen Prell, Ellen Umansky, Elie Wiesel, Arnold Jacob Wolf, Walter Wurzbarger, Michael Wyschogrod.

Sh'ma welcomes articles from diverse points of view. Hence, the opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the editors. Donations to *Sh'ma* are tax-deductible. *Sh'ma* is available in microform from University Microfilms Internat'l., Ann Arbor, MI.

Book reviews are by Eugene B. Borowitz.

Address all correspondence, subscriptions and change of address notices to *Sh'ma*, c/o CLAL, 99 Park Avenue, Suite S-300, New York, NY 10016. Telephone: 212-867-8888; FAX: 212-867-8853.

Sh'ma (ISSN 0049-0385) is published bi-weekly except June, July and August, by CLAL, 99 Park Avenue, Suite S-300, New York, NY 10016. Subscription: \$29 for two years in U.S.; \$18 for one year; \$21 a year overseas; 10 or more to one address, \$9 each year. Retired or handicapped persons of restricted means may subscribe for one year at half price.

Sh'ma Online, an interactive discussion group, is available through any online service which can exchange with the Internet, such as CompuServe, GEnie, Prodigy, America Online, MCIMail, ATMail or Delphi. To join, send a one-line message to: listproc@shamash.nysernet.org saying: **subscribe shma** your full name. Messages to *Sh'ma Online* can then be sent to: shma@shamash.nysernet.org

Copyright © 1995 by CLAL.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Sh'ma*, c/o CLAL, 99 Park Avenue, S-300, New York, NY 10016-1599.

Second-class postage paid at New York, NY
January 6, 1995

women's spiritual retreat, amazed and mystified by a need to be with other women. There is something distinctive about a woman's experience of the world. I do not know if it is biologically or sociologically determined, or how much of each, and if that shared experience of women emerges from the negative sources of powerlessness or victimization (as a *yiddische neshama*, for instance, often described as the Jewish capacity for compassion, may have been shaped and conditioned by lots of pain.)

Last (for now), Judaism is a religious system of distinctiveness and distinctions--between Israel and the other nations, kosher and *treif*, Shabbat and the six days of creation. To what degree will challenging issues of gender--male and female distinctiveness--change the shape of the Judaism we have known?

Changes bring loss. As I learned in bringing our firstborn to college this fall, sometimes some things have to die before something else can be born. There will undoubtedly be losses as we move to redefine our understanding of gender. But something new will be born. It is part of our growing up. □

What it means to be a Jewish woman in the age of egalitarianism

Adina Lewittes

Before I attempt an answer, allow me two qualifications. Firstly, the perspective from which I ponder this question is that of a young wife and mother and a recently ordained Conservative rabbi. Secondly, I don't believe we live in an "age of egalitarianism". The Conservative movement is still trying to figure out how to celebrate the uniqueness of men and women within a context of complete and unqualified religious equality. It has not yet discovered how to be completely comfortable with the differences of religious experience between men and women within a unified, democratic religious community.

And that's all right. We are living through a revolution seeking to create such a reality. And in the midst of a revolution is often the most exciting place to be.

Still, what does it mean to be a Jewish woman in this age of transformation?

Today we are experiencing a burst of religious creativity in the quest to sanctify the distinctive perspec-

RABBI ADINA LEWITTES is the Advisor to Students at the Rabbinical School of the Jewish Theological Seminary.

tives of women on life, God, Torah and community. New prayers, rituals and *midrashim* continue to develop which express uniquely female understandings of our faith. There are those who are concerned by the seeming lack of boundaries of this experimentation. Can any experience, they ask, be sanctified and considered within the realm of Jewish tradition? Is there some point beyond which a new ritual or prayer is no longer "Jewish"? These are neither simple nor insignificant questions.

We are unable at this moment to define these borders, but, as the history of ritual testifies, they will eventually emerge. We are, as I said, in a phase of exploration. While it's important for critics to remember that, it is equally important for those of us in the thick of it to remember, for the phase of experimentation is not without responsibilities. It requires of us to be ever self-critical, to be willing to be changed in addition to doing the changing, and to always balance our own needs with those of our communities.

This phase of the revolution might be intimidating to some, and maybe it should be for all of us. We must not, however, allow it to be paralyzing.

Bringing Equity To Egalitarianism

While for many, ritual and prayer innovations may seem old hat, what has not accompanied these developments towards egalitarianism has been religious creativity in the area of halakhah.

Notwithstanding how fulfilling it is for Jewish women to participate fully in Jewish life, many are painfully discovering that the halakhic responsibilities they fought to undertake are not easily upheld. Most women bring a host of equally demanding religious priorities to the discussion of egalitarianism. These include, but are not limited to, raising children, maintaining a home and providing for a family's daily needs. Coupled with professional duties, it is often difficult if not impossible to also fulfill the halakhic obligations we have assumed, such as daily prayer and study.

The fact that men who take primary roles in the home can now empathize and express firsthand understanding of the traditional rabbinic exemption of women from public ritual for precisely these reasons is well and good. Now that I as a woman am obligated in these *mitzvot*, I also have a better understanding of the sensitivity of the rabbinic exemption. However, the exemption no longer suffices.

To those of us who feel called to somehow balance the sacred demands of parenthood, work and halakhah, a straight exemption belittles rather than hallows our struggle. And it is no simple struggle. It is an existential

challenge to fulfill all the parts of who we are, and who we have become, as Jewish women.

That the time has come to engage in creative halakhic discourse reexamining the way our tradition relates to those who grapple with conflicting religious priorities should come as no surprise. If we take seriously the idea that Jewish law is an organic system organizing every facet of our lives, then it would be halakhically naive to introduce legal change in one particular area without anticipating and addressing its halakhic ramifications in another.

The community must recognize that the decisions to grant women new halakhic status with regard to prayer, ritual and leadership cannot simply be implemented without giving consideration to the other religious components of women's lives and to the unique experiences as women which they will naturally bring to their new roles.

This issue is now more than ever a challenge to the Conservative movement. In the past, only those women who felt able and willing to assume equal religious status with regard to prayer were invited to do so. Recently, however, Chancellor Ismar Schorsch declared all women to be *a priori* equal to men with respect to prayer obligations. The above concerns, then, are more far reaching than ever, and demand serious and prompt consideration.

Working Toward The future

I have only begun to think about the legal traditions which could help us explore these issues. I imagine a new look at the *Havineinu*, the abridged *amidah*, or a new understanding of *tefillah b'zmanah*, praying within specific time frames. I call on those of us who are thinking about these issues to share with each other and work together to create a movement in which women can fulfill all of their halakhic obligations, old and new.

Moreover, for our discussion to have integrity, the halakhic conclusions we arrive at for women will necessarily also impact the religious lives of many men who now assume primary family roles.

Finally, as Shira Milgrom writes in her essay, all change inevitably results in some sort of loss. Indeed, though I have gained immeasurably from joining an egalitarian community, I have also lost. For example, as a young girl, during the hour after candle-lighting on Friday night, the men would go to *shul* and the women would stay home together. It was our time to talk and share with each other. It was the girls' time. It was sacred time. I miss it. Friday nights are different now that men's and women's ritual roles have merged. No less sacred, but different. I'm not sure what to make of

my loss, if anything. Perhaps my memories will at least serve as a challenge to recreate that aura within new and inclusive communities.

What does it mean to be a Jewish woman in the age of egalitarianism? As long as the "age" is in process, it means to recognize that process, to engage our tradition with the fullest understanding of ourselves as women, and to acknowledge the losses along with the rewards that result as we shape Judaism for the 21st century.

This is all I can offer now. Don't worry, though. My grandchildren will have lots more to say. □

The myth of egalitarianism

Rivkah Myers Shifren

Understanding what it means to be a Jewish woman first requires accepting that Hashem created each living creature with a definite purpose and function. The whole concept of egalitarianism contradicts this premise. Does the gazelle mourn over the fact that it is not an eagle? Does it bemoan its inability to fly, even though it is endowed with tremendous beauty and grace?

Within a Jewish context, it is oxymoronic to say that a Jewish woman is "equal" to a man. Even in their creation, man and woman were two parts of the same whole, and therefore complementary, not identical. A woman can be *different*, and was indeed created by Hashem, to fulfill a different role and function than her male counterpart--and accepting this reality, there is no true sameness, no "equality".

Cherishing Woman's Way

There is a falseness that surrounds someone's desire to be "like a man" in her quest to perform masculine duties in the Torah realm. A woman who is raised with the idea that she is perfect and whole exactly as she is, that her obligations and relationship to Hashem are valuable and important, has no need to seek out and add to her list of functions those mitzvahs that are male in nature.

She brings to her relationships with others her qualities of warmth and intelligence, modesty and kindness. Does this mean that she must be subjugated to her male

RIVKAH MYERS SHIFREN is publisher of *Bat Kol--A Journal for the Traditional Jewish Woman*. She lives in Los Angeles with her husband, Rabbi Nachum Shifren and their 3 children, ages 3, 1½ and 2 months.

counterpart? No! It's important to make clear distinction between cultural standards and mores, and legitimate halakhic demands. When women have been degraded and mistreated (and indeed they have), the fault lies with cultural influences, not the Torah's viewpoint. The Rambam himself exhorts Jewish husbands to *honor* their wives *more* than themselves.

The traditional Jewish woman fulfills her role in the way the Creator envisioned it. The image of the downtrodden, subservient woman, always in the shadows, silent, pregnant and in the kitchen, is an image most "egalitarian feminists" rail against. Although this may have been the "norm" for countless years, it has nothing to do with the true and heavenly purpose of the Jewish woman. The intended purpose of every Jew, whether male or female, is to draw down godliness into this world. But this is to be achieved within the framework designed by the Creator, not by an act of our own self-will.

The Way To The End Of Days

Jewish women are often criticized for having large families as though there is no higher design involved or as if this were their sole reason for existence. Nowhere in the Torah does it say that women cannot teach, practice medicine or own a business. Giving birth is certainly not the only critical role entrusted to the feminine being, but it is a role only she can manifest. While bearing and raising numerous children is often looked upon not only with distaste, but with disgust by many in secular society, the Jewish woman sees in her children an opportunity to imbue future generations with a love of Torah and God. To the Orthodox woman, each child brings its own blessings. Each child is a spark of the infinite--each Jewish *neshama* born and brought down to this earth brings us one step closer to Moshiach. There is a superb holiness in manifesting each Jewish soul into its earthly body.

A truly enlightened Jewish woman finds joy in her task of carrying out her designated mitzvot. While both men and women are obligated to perform many of the mitzvot commanded in the Torah, only men, for example are obligated to *daven* in a *minyan*, to put on *tefillin*, wear *tzitzit*, etc. This is the role designated for them in the Torah. The same way that a *Kohen* has rights to the priestly duties in the *Beis Hamikdosh*, while a Levy or Israel is barred from that particular *avoda* (service), so too, men and women have their assigned tasks. The fact that women do not have certain obligations does not make them minor players in the scheme of Jewish life. We must constantly bring the focus of each aspect of our

lives back to the spiritual source and how it relates to the Creator's intention.

Those who sincerely believe that they must take on the masculine tasks of a man in order to become closer to Hashem (e.g., pray as part of a *minyan*, put on *tzitzit*, etc.) lack an acceptance of who they are as Jewish women. *Avoda* to Hashem is fulfilled when we act on what Hashem has asked of us, not what *we* perceive Hashem wants from us, or even farther removed, what *we ourselves desire*, regardless of what Hashem has asked of us.

The Torah clearly demands that we observe mitzvot such as *kashrus*, *tefilla* (prayer), covering the hair (for married women, *taharas hamishpacha* (family purity), *mikvah*, *tznius* (modesty), etc...these are essential to Jewish womanhood. If a man were to wear a *shaitel* (wig), would it make him a better Jew? After all, the mitzvah of covering one's hair (considered an *erva*--nakedness) is certainly as vital as putting on *tefillin*. But we can see, that even though it might make an individual man "feel" closer to Hashem, *it is not required of him, and therefore its value is lessened, and in fact does not satisfy the requirement of having performed a mitzvah at all.*

When a woman breastfeeds her baby, it is something that *only she* can do. Her husband may be able to give the baby a bottle, and one can even argue that the end result is "equal", i.e., the baby is fed. However, only the mother can say that she has "nursed" her child, because that is a function that only she can perform. A man can only "mimic" her function, not fulfill it. His level of sincerity becomes irrelevant to the task.

A friend related that she attended a social/religious event, where one of the women present was wearing a *kippah*, however, the woman's husband's head was bare. The irony of the situation is evident. Each felt compelled to make a statement, but was it made to serve the will of Hashem or to be self-serving?

We must always be cognizant of our struggle to fulfill the will of Hashem, as it will always be countered with our desire to act upon our *own* willful desires. Being "equal" implies being equal to *someone*. If in our attempt to bring about equality we merely mimic a man's role, of what value is our action? Even more so, what message are we imparting to our daughters? That being female is somehow lacking, faulty? Why is greater emphasis not placed on the value of women as Jewesses with unique

**PURIM'S COMING
DEADLINE:
FEBRUARY 10
THINK FUNNY!**

and crucial roles to play in Jewish life? One does not have to be a man to be a good Jew. Jewish women, now more than ever, are educated both secularly and religiously. We are intellectually and spiritually infused with confidence that being female and Jewish does not relegate us to obscurity. Our task is one of greatness because we acknowledge ourselves as creations of Hashem and we know Whom we serve. □

Mazel tov, you are a Jewish lesbian

Rebecca Weiner

When I think of being a Jewish woman in the mid 1990s, I am struck by the *mazel* (good fortune) that I have. As a Jewish woman, I have had role models such as women rabbis, Golda Meir and Barbara Boxer to name a few. I have seen Jewish women rise in every field, in particular Jewish ones. I have seen the glass ceilings shatter like wedding kiddush cups and Jewish women rise to new professional heights. This is not to say that my experience of being a Jewish woman is as sweet as havdalah spices. However, the issues that impact upon me as a Jewish lesbian are more dire than the issues that impact upon me as a Jewish woman.

Some would be surprised to hear that my feelings of *mazel* also extend to my life as a Jewish lesbian. How can you feel lucky as a Jewish lesbian? How can luckiness be derived from the experience of homophobia, marginalization and the more subtle although not more benign experience of invisibility, hurdles I do not necessarily have to overcome in my experience as a Jewish woman?

Fortunate Struggles

Perhaps this *mazel* stems from the fact that this Jewish lesbian feminist was raised in the 70s, came out in the 80s and is thirty-something in the "gay" 90s. Perhaps it is also true because a large part of my life has been spent in the San Francisco Bay area, an area that is known for its large and powerful feminist gay, lesbian, bi-sexual population, an area where I know of three Jewish lesbian weddings that took place in the past nine months.

However, I don't believe my sense of *mazel* is derived from the fact that I wasn't born in a time or in an area when and where my homosexuality would have been

REBECCA WEINER, a drama therapist, has served as a Jewish educator for the past ten years in the Bay Area .

impossible. My sense of luckiness at being a Jewish lesbian is instead derived from the struggle I have had to go through to have both identities live comfortably with each other. The struggle I have had to maintain some *Sholom Bayit* within my psychic house.

The internal narratives seething through my brain goes something like this, "You are a nice Jewish girl who will sit with your legs crossed, keep a semi-kosher home and wear your mother's wedding dress and bring a little *naches* into your parents' life" OR "You are a radical lesbian of the 90s who is freeing yourself and those who come after you from the oppressive hegemony of the patriarchy." Out of these divisive voices I have managed to create a third more moderate voice which states, "You will not abandon either your lesbian or Jewish identity in an attempt to have each."

Maintaining An Integrated Self

I feel lucky because I have maintained both identities strongly and fulfillingly. There have, of course, been times when I have felt that I had to give one up. When my Orthodox sister told me I was a shame to the Jewish people and I wouldn't be allowed to bring my lovers to her home, I felt a desire to run as far from black hats and Leviticus as my Nikes could take me. And when Christmas trees are erected in the Castro as "Holiday Trees", or gay culture seems to be reduced down to one big fashion show, I crave the genuineness of my Jewish roots. I find myself seeking the safe haven of any *shul*, even one that might not accept me.

So I return to the rich struggle of carving out a life for myself as a Jewish lesbian and it reminds me of the history of my ancestors. A history that does not include living lives as Jews easily or safely. This relationship to fear and danger places me closer to my ancestors than many of my heterosexual Jewish friends. They can attend High Holiday services, give money to Federation even subscribe to *Commentary* or *Tikkun* and feel that they are living full Jewish lives without thoughts of danger or fear.

This is not true for me. To have a full Jewish lesbian life, I expose myself to homophobia and/or antisemitism on a daily basis. Even for me to write this article I have to consider the ramifications. Should I ever move to the East coast, could I get a job as Jewish educator? Who will think less of me? Who will read this and feel all my *mitzvot* and good intentions are for naught because my life does not include a basic tenet of Judaism, marriage to a man?

However, I know if I don't struggle, if I don't risk homophobic rejection, I will be living my Jewish life absent of my full *kavanah*. This struggle has made me appreciate my Judaism, has made me relish the sweetness

I find when all prejudices slip away and I am alone with Shabbat or havdalah or a group of curious students. I am lucky to have had to struggle with my Jewish lesbian identity because I am a stronger more devoted Jew as a result.

Creating A Home Within

The *mazel* I have is further enhanced by the bridges I have been able to create for myself and other Jewish gays and lesbians. Some of the ways in which I have tried to bring together these two passions in my life include teaching Hebrew school in a school for children of gays and lesbians, having two serious relationships with women who would attend rabbinic school (thus almost becoming a new archetype for the 90s "The Lesbian Rebbetzin") and committing myself to fighting homophobia within the Jewish institutions where I work.

I feel lucky that my outspokenness has been met for the most part with open minds. I have seen the mainstream Jewish organizations I work for challenge themselves in the area of homophobia. I also am part of a large extended *hevrah* of Jewish gay men and lesbians spanning this country and across the world, that include scholars, rabbis and rabbinic students, camp directors, and Jewish educators and communal workers. This is not a group of Jews who are "light the menorah on Chanukah, eat a little matzah around April sometime Jews". These are gay and lesbian Jews whose commitment is helping to advance Judaism into the 21st century.

Recently I had the *mazel* to attend a bat mitzvah of a young woman who was raised by a lesbian mother. Standing at the *bima* were the child, her mother and her grandmother as well as the woman rabbi officiating. I was the young woman's bat mitzvah tutor. As she finished chanting her portion and the cries of *mazel tov* echoed in the synagogue, I knew that *mazel* extended to me and every Jewish woman and Jewish lesbian in the room. □

But others say about...

Pluralism

As the Reform representative involved in the discussions with the Princeton Jewish center described in Michael Rapoport's article (*Sh'ma* 25/482), it became clear that the PJC leaders wanted the synagogue movements to

❖ ❖ ❖ Ta sh'ma ❖ ❖ ❖

We invite you to send us your favorite text and comment. Submissions should not exceed 200 words. Be sure to include proper citation of sources. Hebrew will appear in transliteration.

Susan Grossman

*Miyemini Michael, Mismoli Gabriel
Milfani Uriel, V'ahari Rafael
V'al roshi Shekhinat El.*

On my right is Michael, on my left is Gabriel
Before me is Uriel, and behind me is Rafael,
And over me is *Shekhinat El*.

SH'MA AL HAMITAH (BEDTIME SH'MA)

I sing this to my son each night before he goes to sleep. He looks intently in each direction and smiles, comforted that these angels have taken up their places. They guard him from the monsters who sneak into his room at night to lurk in the shadows and behind the door. He is most comforted by the *Shekhinah* who hovers above him and wipes from his forehead the fears of the day just past and the concerns of the day to come. He understands the *Shekhinah* as *Shabbat haMalkah*, the Sabbath Queen, who brings the soft blanket of evening to offer comfort to the world on Friday nights. During the rest of the week, my son informs me, she spends her time watching over the little children and, I add, their parents as well.

SUSAN GROSSMAN is the rabbi of Genesis Agudas Achim Congregation in lower Westchester, NY, and co-editor of *Daughters of the King: Women and the Synagogue*. Her musical setting of this prayer is being arranged by composer and cantor Dr. Gerald Cohen.

accept their own definition of movement affiliation. They would allow individual members of their congregation to decide which--if any--of the three movements they wish to support. The congregation itself would make no commitment to any movement, with the result that their leadership and full membership could make use of the services of each of the movements, while providing financial support far less than that provided by neighboring affiliated Reform and Conservative congregations. They did not appreciate that our national synagogue movements serve congregations--not individuals...

The conversations with PJC were similar to those of a synagogue attempting to reach a membership agreement with a wealthy family who says they want to affiliate--but only on their own terms. Since only one member of the family wants to attend services at that particular synagogue service, the offer to pay half dues--and can't understand why the congregation has to say no. Instead of making hard decisions, they berate the movements for rewriting their policies for each and every congregation, and thereby force their neighboring affiliated congregation to foot PJC's share of the bill for building Jewish life in North America.

Rabbi Daniel Frelander
New York, NY

Clal Yisrael

Sh'ma (25/482) struck a most responsive cord. What a delight to know that there are congregations that have overcome the barriers of denominational Judaism.

I am the full-time religious leader (in Butler they call me Rabbi) of a small, United Synagogue affiliated congregation. Belonging to something larger, being affiliated has always been important to me, but neither I nor most of our congregants have any strong commitment to the Conservative movement. The congregation continues to belong, because we have always been Conservative; there is a historic and communal commitment. While some of the older families identify themselves as Conservative, there are very few who live their Jewish lives according to Conservative standards.

Most of the newer and younger families are intermarried and have no interest in denominational squabbles. Given a choice, most of them would feel more comfortable with Reform or Reconstructionist Judaism. Or better yet with a vibrant, active, spiritually-oriented Judaism that is free of divisive labels, that encourages participation without judging what is done through the narrow lens of denominational partisanship.

Each of the major movements has its own publications, as well as national and regional conferences. They

provide study guides and help with organizational or social action activities. All these are valuable, of high quality and are a reason to support the movements. However, all of these activities, could be combined and in most cases, with some halakhic exceptions, would not be essentially different from each other.

Oh what a joy it would be if one could just be Jewish, support Jewish and communal causes, pray and study without having to worry about party labels.

Do you suppose we should start another movement? Hey, only kidding!!!

Walter B. Boniger
Butler, PA

Book reviews

RIDERS TOWARDS THE DAWN

Albert H. Friedlander. Continuum. \$24.95.

An uncommonly irenic survivor's view of what he and his battered generation have tried to make of their awesome experience. Richly sensitive to poetry and fiction, involved with European efforts to restore understanding, Friedlander speaks with a gentle authority.

ETHICS OF RESPONSIBILITY

Walter S. Wurzburger. JPS. \$20.

That old philosophic canard, that religious obligation is *per se* not "properly" ethical gets a deeply thoughtful, erudite response. Even if abstraction is not your forte you will again and again find common ethical dilemmas illumined in these pages.

FOR THOSE WHO CAN'T BELIEVE

Harold M. Schulweis. Harper Collins. \$20.

The term "sage" acquires new luster from these perceptive essay-lets on the classic problems of belief, of Jewish particularity, of simple human confusion. The keen mind, the fund of tradition, the great heart, make for a unique display of contemporary Jewish wisdom.

Sh'ma

99 Park Avenue, Suite S-300
New York, NY 10016-1599

Second-Class Postage Paid at New York, NY

19961213*501999
Fred Bernstein
11 St Tropez
Newport Beach, CA 92660