



Dear Editor,

In your "Letter from the Editor" about the Nathan Lewin article, which floated for examination the proposition of holding adult family members of suicide/homicide bombers responsible, even to the point of capital punishment, for the homicidal acts of their sons and daughters, you state: "It is legitimate as a Jew to declare that something is clearly wrong and Lewin's solution is hateful and unthinkable." You should have stopped after the word wrong. As you point out, in the same issue Arthur Green makes a credible — although hardly "devastating" — argument that Lewin's proposal is morally weak and pragmatically unsound. But what demon of yours drives you to go on to add: "...and Lewin's solution is hateful and unthinkable"? That seems to be a strange *obiter dicta* that has no justification. Unthinkable? Well, Lewin and you have certainly thought about it. And many of *Sh'ma's* readers, including myself, have thought of it. Hateful? The acts of suicide/homicide bombers are what is hateful. A proposal for limited retribution that might be effective in lessening and/or eliminating such hateful acts — what makes that hateful? Since when did choosing the lesser of two evils in horrendous situations that are forced upon an individual or a nation become "hateful"? Lewin's article does not propose wholesale bombing of whole areas that are the nest-

ing grounds for homicide bombers. There is, if you reread his article, a certain proportionality between the hateful act and the limited retribution. After all, our own American President has said, and I believe correctly, if you harbor a terrorist you are a terrorist.


John W. McGinley, Scranton, Pa.



SocialAction.com features:

- ▶ Weekly Torah commentary from a social activism perspective, written by respected sources
- ▶ Activist event and job opportunity listings
- ▶ In-depth analysis of social issues affecting the Jewish and non-Jewish global community
- ▶ And much, much more!



<p>For Hannukah this year, buy a gift subscription to</p> <h1>Sh'ma.</h1> <p>Send a friend or relative required reading for keeping up with contemporary Jewish issues. Your gift, acknowledged <i>in time for the holiday</i>, will arrive monthly for a year.</p>	<h2>Gift Subscription Form</h2> <p>✦ From Your name: _____ (An acknowledgement card will be sent for you.)</p> <p>✦ To Recipient's Name: _____ Street: _____ City/State/Zip: _____</p> <p>✦ To Recipient's Name: _____ Street: _____ City/State/Zip: _____</p> <p>✦ To Recipient's Name: _____ Street: _____ City/State/Zip: _____</p>
<p>"Sh'ma offers more ideas per page than any other American Jewish periodical. In recent years, it has become must reading for anyone interested in the central issues facing American Jews." Jonathan D. Sarna, Brandeis University</p> 	<p>Enclose this form and a check for \$15* per subscription to: Sh'ma / P.O. Box 9129 / Newton, MA 02464 *This special gift offer is only available for subscribers.</p>

Non-Profit
US Postage
PAID
Permit No. 401
Frederick, MD

Change Service Requested
New London, NH 03257
Post Office Box 267
